First Year Students and the Research Process: hearing student voices

Diane VanderPol
Emily A. B. Swanson
Amy S. Kelly
Methods

• Recruited students from English 110 (Composition and Research)
• Interviewed 11 first year students
• Interviewed students after they completed final research paper
• Asked pre-set questions but allowed interviewers to explore interesting ideas, thoughts, or topics
Findings

• Topic Selection
• Finding Materials
• Citation & Use
• Help
Findings: Topic Selection
My mom got diagnosed with Celiac’s disease and so we [family] heard about this diet, it’s called the Paleolithic Diet. And we started kind of doing it, and we started getting into it. And then I heard there was a controversy over it... So I was like, well, it’s something that’s in my life right now. Something that I can write about and be interested in.

**Topic Selection: Emotional Connection**
I had already done some research on [the topic] in high school, and I thought it was really interesting... I thought it might be easier already having some ideas.
Topic Selection: Ease of finding information

“I decided on ones that I could find the most information on and that I felt knowledgeable about and that I thought would be interesting to readers.”

“And there were a lot of documents, and like, primary documents really that related to the topic that’d be easy to find.”
Findings: Finding Materials
Finding Materials: Information Environment

“I spent a lot of time trying to find something relevant to what I was writing about, and it wasn’t so much a fault of the system. It was more of a “I’m looking for things that are very specific,” always going to limit my results.”

“Yeah, the problem I have is, it’s a newer debate. There’s no, like, reliable resources or stuff. It’s all peoples’ opinion.”
Well I started looking at things. Like, the historical part was the easiest, because there are tons of history books, tons of websites [on Holocaust history], and so Google was my first choice.... I just like Google, because it’s my go-to thing, I just use it. The only drawbacks I would say is that it pulls up stuff that’s not really related. It’s not really specific. And so you get just a ton of information. So that’s why it took me a while, to kind of weed it out.
Finding Materials: Flexibility without Mastery

“I went back on, like EBSCO. Like the databases on there. And then also popular sources, just on Google.”

“I did EBSCHost and… ProQuest. I only search Google for small stuff.”
Finding Materials: Difficulties with searching

I put in ‘airport security’ and then in parentheses AND body scanners or AND pat downs... And then when I was looking for drug sniffing dogs, I did the double search. With Google and the quotes, to single it out.
Findings: Citation & Use
[The professor] said she wanted to see at least three citations in each paragraph. Because of that’s the way a paper should be. So… she had us go through and make a chart. So we had all of our ideas at the top and then our resources. And whenever you had a resource that went with an idea, I would summarize what they said in that idea. So I went through and organized my sources that way and then I would go through them and condense them in paragraphs.
“Because I knew already, about the Paleolithic Diet, I just needed more information so that I could be more accurate in my statistics, or more accurate in proving a point.”

“Well, so I’d use them [the sources] to, like, emphasize my ideas.”
Findings: Help
“As soon as I put it in my own words, I needed some help with sentence flow and paragraph transitions. I went to the Writing Center… [the student consultant] read over it and helped me with some transitions. And then I had a friend who’s really good at grammar and reading over stuff, and she helped me with the whole thing.”

“But oftentimes my brother… I’d ask his opinion on certain things… I think it was a couple times when I’d ask, if it was a paragraph, does this sound right to you? Does this seem clear?”
I really didn’t feel like I needed too much help finding sources. All year during class we’d been shown a bunch of different databases and search engines and stuff like that.
Conclusions
Prior knowledge

- Incredibly important
- Use prior knowledge for “good”
- Stumbling block: moving from topic to keyword searching
Search Confusion

• New tasks such as doing research, writing scholarly papers, and reading scholarly materials increase a student’s cognitive load
• Overwhelmed with catalog & database selection, search strategy, selecting sources
• Students could benefit from discipline-based and discrete task-based Information Literacy instruction
• Librarians & faculty must have clear expectations and repeatedly model each element of the complex processes involved in research and academic writing.
• Trial & error learning may not be the most effective
Synthesis

• No more checklists i.e. use 3 scholarly articles
• Students should be encouraged to use the most relevant and appropriate sources for the hypothesis
• Librarians & faculty must help students to develop the skills to read critically, compare and synthesize information for use in their own thought and knowledge development
Scaffolding

- Problems in early stages of the research process snowball as students progress through the paper
- Librarians & faculty need to scaffold assignments & create low stakes research tasks
- Importance of early intervention
Moving Forward

- Librarians & Faculty should collaborate to design research assignments
- Isolate discrete tasks of the research process for consideration and focus, and emphasize that critical reading and synthesis skills are scaffolded and developmental in nature
- Help students identify the gaps in their understanding or abilities
- Celebrate and capitalize on students’ desire to become proficient undergraduate researchers and scholars
Questions?